

**STAFF REPORT****PLANNING COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING OF****JUNE 20, 2023**

**PREPARED BY:** Jennifer Hagen, Senior Planner  
JHagen@brentwoodca.gov

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION:** Item No. 3, An application for Trumark Trailside, which includes a Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map (VTSM 9610) to create 63 single-family residential lots, one bio-retention basin, one open space lot adjacent to Sand Creek, and other related improvements. The project also includes a design review (DR 22-006) for the homes to be constructed on the 63 lots (including 57 single-family detached homes and six affordable duets). The project is located at 1777 Apricot Way (APNs 019-092-013 and 019-092-034). Pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act Section 15183, the project is consistent with the development density established by a Community Plan, General Plan, or Zoning for which an environmental impact report (EIR) has been certified. An EIR was prepared and certified by the City Council as part of the Brentwood General Plan (SCH# 2014022058) in 2014. Therefore, no further environmental analysis is required as the proposed Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map is consistent with the General Plan.

**PROJECT SIZE & LOCATION:** The 20.90-acre project site consists of two parcels at 1777 Apricot Lane at the terminus of Strathaven Place and Montclair Place (APNs 019-092-013 and 019-092-034).

**GENERAL PLAN:** Residential – Low Density (R-LD)

**ZONING:** Planned Development No. 35 Subarea K (PD 35-K)

**OWNERS:** Melrina A. Houser, Salvo E. Arione, and Debra R. Maggiora, et al.

**APPLICANT:** Trumark Homes / Pam Nieting

**PREVIOUS ACTIONS:** N/A

## BACKGROUND:

The project site was annexed into the City of Brentwood as a part of the “Northwest annexation” in November of 1998. At the time of annexation, the parcels were zoned Planned Development 35 (PD-35). Development standards for Subarea K, in which the parcels are located, were not established until October of 2006. These regulations were adopted in conjunction with a city-wide zoning ordinance update to adopt standards for each residential Planned Development zone. Based on available historical records, the property has consisted of agricultural land with no known homestead or development.

## PROJECT CONTEXT:

The project site consists of two parcels that are currently undeveloped and that have historically been used for agricultural purposes. The project site appears to be periodically mowed and/or disked, consisting mostly of disturbed ruderal grassland vegetation. There are no structures, trees, or other vegetation present.

### Surrounding Land Uses

- North: TSM 8556 (existing single-family homes) PD-35 Subarea G
- East: TSM 8556 (existing single-family homes) PD-35 Subarea G, and existing RE-Ranchette Estate lots
- South: Sand Creek, County Flood Control detention basin, and the future Sand Creek Sports Complex
- West: TSM 8982 (single-family homes under construction, Parkside Villas) PD-35 Subarea I

**Figure 1: Aerial with Project Site**



2021 Aerial photo

### Detailed Project Description

Trumark Homes is requesting a vesting tentative subdivision map (VTSM 9610) to create 63 single-family residential lots, one bio-retention basin, one open space lot adjacent to Sand

Creek, and other related improvements. The project also includes a design review (DR 22-006) for the homes to be constructed on the 63 lots (including 57 single-family detached homes and six affordable duets). The duet units would have an average lot size of 4,188 square feet and the remaining 57 residential lots would range from 8,000 to 13,674 square feet in size, with the exception of one larger estate lot located along the eastern edge of the site (adjacent to the existing Ranchette Estate lots) that would be 30,000 square feet in size.

The project includes six affordable units; two reserved for very low-income households, two reserved for low-income households, and two reserved for moderate-income households. The applicant is not proposing to utilize the State Density Bonus law, and is complying with the City's density transition and mid-point policies as outlined in the General Plan.

## **ANALYSIS:**

### *General Plan and Housing Element*

The General Plan designates the 20.90-acre project site for Residential - Low Density development, allowing for a range of 1.1-5.0 dwelling units per gross acre, with a mid-range of 3.0 units per acre. According to the General Plan, density calculations are to be made based on a project's gross acreage. The General Plan also states that the mid-point of the range is the starting point for density calculations. This project would result in an overall density of 3.0 dwelling units per gross acre, consistent with the General Plan.

In addition to applicable State laws, the City's 2014 General Plan and 2023 Housing Element include goals and policies to ensure that adequate provisions are made for meeting the housing needs to all economic segments of Brentwood. These goals and policies are supported through actions listed in the General Plan and Housing Element, and include integrating affordable housing into single-family neighborhoods so that the overall construction and quality of the affordable homes is compatible with that of the market rate units. The proposed project meets the intent of the goals and polices established by the General Plan and Housing Element as follows:

**Goal LU 1.** *Establish a land use pattern in Brentwood that provides for a diverse, self-sufficient community that offers a broad spectrum of job opportunities, housing types, community facilities, and commercial services.*

The project provides a land use pattern that provides for a diverse and self-sufficient community that offers a broad spectrum of housing by providing 57 detached single-family market rate homes and six attached affordable duet units.

**Goal H-1.** *Facilitate a diversity of housing opportunities to enhance the City's living environment and to satisfy the shelter needs of all Brentwood residents.*

The project provides a land use pattern that provides for a diverse community that offers a broad spectrum of housing by providing 57 detached single-family market rate homes and six attached affordable duet units, which will be accessible to residents of varying income levels.

**Goal H-2.** *Encourage housing that is affordable to all socio-economic segments of Brentwood's population.*

The project includes six affordable units; two reserved for very low-income households, two reserved for low-income households, and two reserved for moderate-income households for the

Brentwood population. The remaining 57 units are expected to meet the City's above moderate housing needs.

**Action H.2a.** *Compliance with Affordable Housing Ordinance: All new residential projects shall provide affordable housing units in accordance with the City's adopted Affordable Housing Ordinance Chapter 17.725. The City will continue to review and monitor the ongoing effectiveness of the City's affordable housing ordinance to ensure developers provide a certain percentage of new homes to qualifying households at an affordable cost for the longest feasible time. The ordinance shall also continue to include a list of automatically available development incentives to encourage the construction of the inclusionary units, as well as provide the details for available alternatives to satisfy inclusionary housing obligations.*

The project complies with the City's Affordable Housing Ordinance by providing affordable units in accordance with the ordinance that was in effect at the time the project was deemed complete in May 2022, and is subject to the ten percent affordability requirement. The project is providing six affordable units, with two reserved for very low-income households, two reserved for low-income households, and two reserved for moderate-income households, consistent with the ordinance.

**Action LU 2a.** *Utilize density transitions in order to protect the integrity of existing land use patterns and minimize the impacts on existing uses and residents. It shall be City policy:*

1. *To locate lower residential densities adjacent to open space, areas of agricultural use, and existing lower density residential areas;*
2. *To locate higher residential densities in proximity to services, transit, and/or employment activity centers;*
3. *To require buffer lots in new residential developments that abut or face existing large residential lots as follows:*
  - b. *proposed lots facing or abutting existing residential lots zoned Ranchette Estate (RE) or of one acre or more shall have a minimum area of 20,000 square feet;*

Given the presence of lots zoned Ranchette Estate directly to the east, the proposed lot adjacent to these parcels is required by this policy to have a minimum area of 20,000 square feet. The project meets this requirement by proposing one 30,000 square foot lot along the eastern project boundary. This configuration would provide a visual buffer to minimize the impact of the development on the existing residents and protect the integrity of the existing land use patterns to the east.

#### Zoning Consistency

The project is zoned Planned Development 35 (PD-35), Subarea K. The required minimum lot size is 8,000 square feet and the proposed lots range from 8,000 to 13,674 square feet in size, with the exception of the duet lots and one larger estate lot located along the eastern edge of the site, adjacent to the existing Ranchette Estate lots that would be 30,000 square feet in size. As conditioned, the proposed lots are to adhere to all size and dimensional requirements, setback requirements, and the other aspects of the development for PD-35, Subarea K, as provided in the table below:

	<b>PD-35 Subarea K</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
<b>Minimum Lot Size</b>	8,000 square feet <sup>1</sup>	8,000 square feet <sup>1</sup>
<b>Minimum Lot Width</b>	70 feet <sup>2</sup>	70 feet <sup>2</sup>
<b>Minimum Front Yard Setback</b>	20 feet <sup>3</sup>	20 Feet <sup>3</sup>
<b>Minimum Side Yard Setback</b>	7 feet (with an aggregate of 20 feet)	7 feet (with an aggregate of 20 feet)
<b>Minimum Street Side Setback</b>	10 feet	10 feet
<b>Minimum Rear Yard</b>	20 feet (patios can be at 13 feet)	20 feet (patios can be 13 feet)
<b>Minimum Off-Street Parking Spaces In a Garage</b>	2	2
<b>Maximum Building Height</b>	30 feet and two stories	29 feet, 11 inches
<b>Minimum percentage of required single-story homes or designed in such a manner as to resemble a one-story profile</b>	25%	25.4%
<b>Minimum percentage of required side-loading garages</b>	10%	25.4%

<sup>1</sup> BMC Section 17.725.003.F(1) allows for reduced minimum lot sizes for affordable duet units.

<sup>2</sup> Cul-de-sac lots shall have a width of not less than seventy feet measured thirty feet from the front property line.

<sup>3</sup> Porches may encroach up to 4 feet into the required front setback per Chapter 17.660.005

<sup>4</sup> Patios may encroach up to 8 feet into the required rear setback per Chapter 17.660.005

#### *Inclusionary Housing Requirement*

The project application was deemed complete in May 2022, and therefore is subject to the City's Affordable Housing Ordinance Chapter 17.725 that was in effect at that time. That ordinance requires the project to reserve ten percent (10%) of total units as affordable units. Under that ordinance, the project is required to provide six affordable units, with two reserved for very low-income households, two reserved for low-income households, and two reserved for moderate-income households. With a total of six for-sale duet units, the project meets the required affordability requirements as required by the City's ordinance.

The designs of the affordable units are comparable to the exterior designs of the market rate units, including materials, architectural elements, and overall construction quality, as well as the number of bedrooms and proportion of bedroom types. The affordable units are also dispersed throughout the development, consistent with the requirements of the applicable ordinance.

#### Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map

The subject site consists of two parcels totaling 20.90-acres in size, each generally rectangular in shape. The proposed vesting tentative subdivision map includes 63 single-family lots, a bio retention lot (Parcel B), and an open space lot (Parcel A) adjacent to Sand Creek. The duet units would have an average lot size of 4,188 square feet and the remaining 57 residential lots

would range from 8,000 to 13,674 square feet in size, with the exception of one larger estate lot that would be 30,000 square feet in size. This lot would be located along the eastern edge of the site, adjacent to the existing Ranchette Estate lots, to assure the proper density transition between the proposed project and the existing homes. The bio-retention lot (Parcel B) for storm water treatment is located on the southeast corner of the site.

Although the project will not have an on-site park, it is directly across the creek from the future Sand Creek Sports Complex and will be providing an upgraded pedestrian crossing over the creek with direct access to the Sand Creek trail adjacent to the future Sand Creek Sports Complex. Consistent with the City's 2019 Parks, Trails and Recreation Master Plan, an on-site park is not required based on the availability of the future park adjacent to the project site and the safe access thereto for project residents. As a draft condition of approval, the developer is subject to the payment of park in-lieu fees to fund community-wide projects, rather than constructing another new park in close proximity to the sports complex (Goal CSF 2, Policy 2-9).

As part of the application process, the Engineering Department and the Contra Costa County Fire Protection District reviewed the proposed vesting tentative subdivision map to verify that safe and acceptable street widths meeting current City standards and Fire District needs have been included. Full improvements would be constructed within the street right-of-way, including utilities, streetlights, curb, gutter, and sidewalk with a landscape strip.

The project involves the construction of the necessary infrastructure to serve the proposed neighborhood and includes plans to connect to existing City infrastructure to provide water and sewer to the site. Storm water quality will be established with a bio-retention basin constructed at the southeast corner of the site pursuant to Contra Costa County and State Water Resources Control Board regulations

#### Access and Circulation

Access would be via the existing streets, Strathaven Place and Montclair Place, that have been stubbed to the northern edge of the site by previous developments. The streets will continue approximately 56 feet in width, with sidewalks connecting to the existing sidewalk and provide access to the open-space buffer for pedestrian access and views. Pedestrian access and sidewalks are proposed along the interior streets within the project site. The adjacent Parkside Villas project, which is currently under construction, includes a trail along its project frontage along Sand Creek that will connect to the western property line of the subject site along the creek corridor, which will be continued as part of this project. In addition, there is an existing pedestrian bridge that crosses Sand Creek within the proposed open-space buffer area, which is proposed to be improved with new handrails to provide access to the Sand Creek trail and future sports complex. The new open-space buffer will be dedicated to the City for operation and maintenance. The subdivision would be oriented in a grid like pattern matching the adjacent Parkside Villas subdivision and adjacent developments, thus creating a fabric of viable and interrelated neighborhoods (Policy LU1-5, LU1-4, Policy CIR 1-2).

#### Master Plotting Plan

The master plotting plan depicts which home plans would be constructed on a particular lot. Consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines, the proposed combination of models and elevation styles serve to diversify the plotting as much as possible. The proposal provides for a varied streetscape, interspersing model plans and duet units. Single-story profile units are typically located on corner lots to provide reduced massing and lot proportions consistent with the residential development and duet units are centrally located mid-block as allowed by Code. In order to provide a varied street scape amongst the duet units, entry to each unit is separated

with a unique and prominent entrance to draw focus away from the massing of the building. In addition, the front yards have been designed with an approximately 16-foot landscape area between each driveway to provide a varied streetscape. A draft condition of approval is included to ensure that elevation styles are not repeated on adjacent lots, thereby ensuring a diverse streetscape and architectural variation.

**Figure 2: Trumark Trailside - Master Plotting Plan**



### Architecture

The proposed architecture is unique, allowing for increased variation of building design and massing throughout the subdivision. There are three home plans for the market rate units and two home plans for the duet units. Each of the floor plans offer a unique configuration of massing, intended to create differentiation and variety on the streetscape, and provide buyers with distinct choices in lifestyle and use of space. The usage/breakdown of the plans are as follows: Plan 1 (25.4%), Plan 2 (31.7%), and Plan 3 (33.3%). These plans are dispersed throughout the subdivision so that no two plans are located next to each other. Given the total number of lots in the subdivision, the number of plans provided exceeds the minimum requirement per the City's Residential Design Guidelines, which require at least one different model for every 25 lots. A summary of the proposed home plans is as follows:

Plan #	Home Size (SF)	Bed/Bath	Garage Spaces	Stories	Maximum Height*
1	3,031	5/3.5	3	One Story Profile	27' 4"
2	3,778	5/4.5	4	Two Story	29' 5"
3	4,340	5/4.5	3	Two Story	29' 11"
Duet A	1,902	3/2.5	2	Two Story	27'
Duet B	2,196	4/3	2	Two Story	27'

\* Note: maximum main building height is 30'

There are three distinctive elevation styles for each home plan (including the duets), which include Farmhouse, Craftsman, and Prairie.



The three elevation styles offered are as follows:

#### **Elevation A - Farmhouse**

The Farmhouse elevations are a mix of board and batten siding and stucco exterior finishes. The roof pitches and design of this style include steeply pitched accent roofs with a pitch of 10:12. Wood porch posts with 'X' style metal railing are also included along the front entry porches.

#### **Elevation B - Craftsman**

The Craftsman elevations are a combination of horizontal wood siding and stucco exterior finishes. Wood siding is used on accent forms and upper locations on each elevation with wood siding and corbel accents used to enhance the gable roofs. The roof pitches and design of this style include a pitch of 4:12 with gable style roof and enhanced eave depths. The porches are accented with tapered stucco columns with stone bases and wood porch rails. Lastly, this elevation includes stone veneer accent features on the front elevations.

#### **Elevation C - Prairie**

The Prairie elevations are a stucco exterior with horizontal wood siding accents defining the base of the homes. The roof pitches and design of this style include a 4:12 pitch with hipped roof forms and larger overhangs. Larger format stone veneer is used to define the entry towers along with horizontal wood siding columns to define the front usable porches.

The exterior materials, massing, roof shape and pitches, trim shapes, colors and materials create a strong neighborhood identity and provide for architectural variation throughout the subdivision. The proposed design provides architectural elements and building forms that reflect attention to detail and general compliance with the City's Design Guidelines.



### Residential Design Guidelines

The following discussion highlights some of the key Residential Design Guidelines (Chapter 2, Subdivisions) that apply to the project:

#### **Section 2.6.1 Provide variety in unit plans.**

- *One distinct plan with four distinctive elevations shall be provided for every 25 units.*

The streetscape is varied by the incorporation of three elevations for each of the three home plans and one duet plan. While the Residential Design Guidelines require the provision of two plans with four distinct elevations per plan, the proposed project is providing a total of 12 varied elevations, ensuring significant architectural variation within the streetscape and, thereby, meeting the intent of the guidelines. In addition, with 9 color schemes, the project will provide significant color scheme variation that creates 36 possible combinations. The project provides a variety in unit plans and elevations consistent with the Design Review Guidelines.

- *Twenty five percent of all units within a subdivision must be single story profile.*

While Plan 1 is not a true single-story home, it provides a single-story profile with a reduced second story that is located to the center of the home, greatly reducing the appearance and massing of the structure from adjacent properties. The design of the home provides a large 2,280 square-foot first floor with a reduced 751-square-foot second story that helps minimize the second story appearance and massing of the overall structure consistent with other projects approved in the City. The project includes one single-story profiled home plan, which is 25.4% of the total units thereby exceeding the minimum 25% requirement.

- *Ten percent of all units within a subdivision must have side-loaded garage configuration.*

The project includes one home plan (Plan 1) with a side-loaded garage to help break up the street scene. Approximately 25.4% of the units have side-loaded garages, thereby exceeding the minimum 10% requirement.

#### **2.6.2 Maintain architectural style integrity** *Architectural styles shall be clearly articulated and consistent in their proportions and details with the traditional models on which they are based.*

No two identical floor plans are repeated side-by-side facing the same street. The façade massing is broken up with varying elevation styles, rooflines, color schemes, and finished materials. Architectural integrity is maintained in that the style of each elevation type remains consistent with the traditional examples on which the style is based, and the elements evident on the front façade are carried around to the less-prominent side and rear elevations. Articulated front façades and the use of rooflines to differentiate the first and second stories help to reduce building massing. Front elevations use porches and finish materials to emphasize points of entry.

Other features identified in the design guidelines are carried through onto the proposed plans; including maintenance of architectural integrity with window-wrapping treatment carried around to the side and rear elevations; inclusion of various roof heights and forms; and the visual emphasis of front doors from the street. Roof forms and pitch angles vary slightly, but are generally consistent throughout each architectural elevation style. Taken together, these elements reflect attention to detail and general compliance with the City's Design Guidelines.

### Lighting

Lighting details and cut sheets for the residential lighting fixtures will be reviewed in conjunction with final design-level submittals for site improvements and building permits for compliance with the City's applicable regulations. As conditioned, all external light fixtures must be of either a cut-off or full-cut off design, per City regulations.

### Preliminary Landscaping

The preliminary landscape plan submitted with the application provides typical front yard landscaping. Shade and ornamental trees proposed on the site are 15-gallon size and 24-inch box as required by the Municipal Code. In addition, the typical front yard landscaping includes a variety of drought tolerant low groundcover and does not include any lawn or grass area. This is consistent with the Commission's recent discussions regarding how to maximize water efficiency in new residential developments. A standard condition of approval requires the submittal of detailed landscape and irrigation plans for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit to ensure compliance with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance.

### **DATE OF NOTICE:**

The City published a public hearing notice in the Brentwood Press and mailed it to property owners within 300 feet of the site on June 9, 2023 and the project site is posted with the required signage. As of the agenda publication, staff has not received any public comments on the application.

### **TERM OF APPLICATIONS:**

In accordance with Government Code Section 66452.6 of the Map Act and BMC Sections 16.050.050 (Effect of Action), all tentative map approvals remain effective for twenty-four months after approval. In order to be consistent with the application terms of Vesting Tentative Map (VTMS 9610), staff is recommending that the associated Design Review (DR 22-006) also be effective for twenty-four months after approval<sup>1</sup>. All applications and permits would terminate twenty-four months from the effective date of their granting, unless actual construction under valid permits has begun within such period. Although not anticipated, such period of time may be extended by the Planning Commission upon application filed at any time before such period has expired.

### **ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:**

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15183<sup>2</sup> provides that projects that are consistent with the development density established by a Community Plan, General Plan, or Zoning for which an environmental impact report (EIR) has been certified "shall not require additional environmental review, except as might be necessary to examine whether there are project-specific significant effects which are peculiar to the project or its site." An EIR was prepared and certified by the City Council in 2014 as part of the Brentwood General Plan (SCH# 2014022058). As is more fully analyzed in the CEQA document that is attached for

---

<sup>1</sup> In accordance with BMC Sections 17.820.011(Termination of permit), an application termination date may be modified beyond the typical one year period at the discretion of the Planning Commission if prescribed.

<sup>2</sup> A summary of Section 15183 is provided in the 'Environmental Analysis – Trumark at Trailside' at pages 3-4 linked here: ['Environmental Analysis – Trumark at Trailside'](#)

reference, as well as the associated appendices that are [linked here](#), the proposed Project is consistent with the development density established by the General Plan EIR because the subdivision will result in new parcels at a density (3.0 units per acre) consistent with the mid-range within the R-LD range of 1.1 to 5.0 units per acre. Compliance with these standards has been included in the conditions of approval for the Project. No additional impacts to on-site resources have been identified beyond what was envisioned in the General Plan EIR. Therefore, no further environmental analysis beyond the Modified Initial Study is required as the requested entitlements are consistent with the General Plan.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution No.'s 23-024 and 23-025, respectively, approving Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map No. 9610 and Design Review No. 22-006 for Trumark Trailside, as conditioned.

Attachments:

Draft Resolution No. 23-024 - Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map  
Draft Resolution No. 23-025 - Design Review  
Trumark Project Description  
Trumark Plan Submittal Package  
Trumark CEQA Analysis